DailyNews

When It Comes to Writs of Administrative Mandamus, the Appealability Rules Are Confused

Tim Kowal June 01, 2023



When challenging an agency action via a writ of administrative mandamus, the trial court's ruling is the appealable order. If you are going to appeal, do not wait around for a judgment, or you could be too late (like in this previous case).

But that is not what happened in the mandamus case of *County of Santa Cruz v. Santa Cruz County Civil Service Commission* (D6 May 5, 2023 no. H049856) 2023

WL 3267749 (nonpub. opn.). The case involved allegations that a sheriff's deputy,

Kelly Kent, failed to properly act on allegations of sexual misconduct against a

correctional officer at the county jail. The Civil Service Commission overruled the

sheriff's demotion, and instead imposed a three-day suspension. The sheriff and the

county filed a petition in the Superior Court for administrative mandamus.

After a hearing, the court granted the writ via minute order, ordering the commission to set aside its decision and demote Kent rather than suspend him. That was in November 2021.

But three months later in February 2022, the court entered its statement of decision. Kent appealed from the statement of decision on March 4.

So which was the appealable order? Last year in *Meinhardt v. City of Sunnyvale* (2022) 76 Cal.App.5th 43, the Fourth District Court of Appeal held that an order on a writ of mandamus was the appealable order—waiting for a later judgment was too late. (But the Supreme Court granted review in *Meinhardt*.)

And a statement of decision ordinarily is not an appealable order. (*Alan v. American Honda Motor Co., Inc.* (2007) 40 Cal.4th 894, 901.)

Here is how the Sixth District came down:

[W]e are satisfied that the trial court's February 1, 2022 statement of decision determined the rights of the parties and disposed of all issues in this case, constituting a final and appealable judgment. (See Dhillon v. John Muir Health (2017) 2 Cal.5th 1109, 1115; Griset v. Fair Political Practices Com. (2001) 25 Cal.4th 688, 698; § 904.1, subd. (a); cf. County of Los Angeles v. Los Angeles County Civil Service Com. (2018) 22 Cal.App.5th 174, 185–188.)

Comment: These cases that conclude that orders that ordinarily are not appealable—like orders sustaining demurrers, orders granting summary judgment, or statements of decision—are appealable, should make you nervous. When the courts are consistent that such orders are not appealable, there is no need to worry about taking an appeal from them: you know you need to wait for a final, appealable order. But when courts hint that they MIGHT be appealable, you need to consider taking an appeal, in an abundance of caution.

Let's hope the Supreme Court gives some guidance when it takes up the appealability of orders on administrative writs of mandamus in *Meinhardt*.

This article was originally published on the website of Thomas Vogele & Associates, APC.

Tim Kowal is an appellate attorney at Thomas Vogele & Associates, APC, with offices in Orange and Monterey counties. He co-hosts the California Appellate Law Podcast at www.CALPodcast.com and publishes a newsletter of appellate tips for trial attorneys at www.tvalaw.com/articles. Contact Tim at tkowal@tvalaw.com.

© The Regents of the University of California, 2023.

Unauthorized use and/or duplication of this material without express and written permission from CEB is strictly prohibited. CEB content does not render any legal, accounting, or other professional service; this content is not intended to describe the standard of care for attorneys in any community, but rather to assist attorneys in providing high quality service to their clients and in protecting their own interests. Attorneys using CEB content in dealing with a specific legal matter should also research original sources of authority. Any opinions contained in CEB content are not intended to reflect the position of the University of California. Materials written by employees of state or federal agencies are not to be considered statements of governmental policies.

RELATED

What Happens to a Fee Award After the Judgment Is Reversed? Try a Stipulated Reversal

Tim Kowal Apr 26, 2023

California Appeal Filed One Minute Late --Literally One Minute --Dismissed As Untimely

Tim Kowal Mar 06, 2023

There Is No Such Thing As a 'Corporate Representative' or 'Person Most Qualified' Witness Tim Kowal Feb 03, 2023

PRACTICE AREAS

Appellate Law

Litigation Practice & Procedure